

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORKUSDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #: _____
DATE FILED: 1/16/2026

| | | |
|---|---|-------------------|
| ----- | X | |
| BLAKE LIVELY, | : | |
| | : | |
| Plaintiff, | : | |
| | : | 24-cv-10049 (LJL) |
| -v- | : | |
| WAYFARER STUDIOS LLC, JUSTIN BALDONI, | : | |
| JAMEY HEATH, STEVE SAROWITZ, IT ENDS WITH | : | |
| US MOVIE LLC, MELISSA NATHAN, THE AGENCY | : | |
| GROUP PR LLC, JENNIFER ABEL, | : | |
| | : | |
| Defendants. | : | |
| | : | |
| ----- | X | |

LEWIS J. LIMAN, United States District Judge:

Before the Court are various requests for sealing and unsealing filed by both parties and non-parties regarding materials submitted in connection with: (1) Plaintiff Blake Lively’s (“Lively”) motion for spoliation sanctions against the Wayfarer Parties,¹ *see* Dkt. No. 862; (2) Third-Party Defendant Jonesworks LLC’s (“Jonesworks”) motion for spoliation sanctions against Third-Party Plaintiff Jennifer Abel (“Abel”), *see* Dkt. No. 867; (3) Abel’s motion for conditional summary judgment against Jonesworks, *see* Dkt. No. 938; and (4) the Wayfarer Parties’ motion for summary judgment against Lively, *see* Dkt. No. 952.

Oral argument on the Wayfarer Parties’ motion for summary judgment and Lively’s motion for spoliation sanctions is scheduled for next Thursday, January 22, 2026. The public has a right to attend that argument and to follow along based on the unredacted summary judgment and spoliation materials—that is, to the extent continued sealing of the materials cannot be

¹ The Wayfarer Parties are Wayfarer Studios LLC, Justin Baldoni, Jamey Heath, Steve Sarowitz, It Ends With Us Movie LLC, Melissa Nathan, The Agency Group PR LLC, and Jennifer Abel.

justified. Accordingly, the Court provides the following bottom-line conclusions on the motions for sealing and unsealing so that the parties have sufficient time to appropriately re-redact and refile the materials before oral argument. The parties who submitted the materials at issue shall refile them in accordance with this Order by January 21, 2026, at 1:00 PM. The Court will in short order provide a written opinion with its “specific, on the record findings” explaining why continued sealing of certain materials is justified. *See Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga*, 435 F.3d 110, 120 (2d Cir. 2006) (citation omitted).²

The motions of non-parties Isabela Ferrer, Betty B Holdings, LLC, Family Hive, LLC, Sony Pictures Entertainment, and William Morris Endeavor Entertainment, LLC are denied except to the extent that they seek sealing of personally-identifying information (“PII”) and except to the extent that Sony seeks sealing of Ex. 23 filed in support of Defendants’ Motion for Summary Judgment.

The motions of the Wallace Non-Parties, Katherine Case (“Case”) and Breanna Butler Koslow (“Koslow”), the Wayfarer Parties, and Lively are denied in part and granted in part as detailed below. The parties are also directed to refile their respective memoranda of law and Rule 56.1 statements consistent with the rulings in this Order. To the extent that the parties’ memoranda of law and Rule 56.1 statements refer to portions of the documents below that the Court now seals, those references should be redacted as well. To the extent that the Court denies a request to seal material that is also referred to in the memoranda of law and the Rule 56.1 statements, that material should not be redacted.

² These bottom-line conclusions do not resolve requests for sealing regarding Abel’s motion for summary judgment or Jonesworks’ motion for spoliation sanctions, as those materials will not be addressed at oral argument and will accordingly be handled in a subsequent order.

Table A: The Wallace Non-Parties' Proposed Redactions and the Court's Rulings

| Exhibit Number | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|------------------|---|---|
| Def. MSJ Ex. 182 | PII | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 182 - SR 1.00000007, Aug 8, 2024 Email |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 183 | PII and sensitive financial account information | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 183 - SR 1.00000008, Aug. 8, 2024 Proposed Quote for a new scope of work |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 184 | PII | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 184 - SR 1.00000011, Aug. 9, 2024 Email |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 215 | Third-party clients or prospective clients | Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' first proposed redaction on p. 29 Exhibit 215 - Lively's Third Amended R&O's to Abel's Second Set o |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 216 | Third-party clients or prospective clients | Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' first proposed redaction on p. 29 Exhibit 216 - Lively's Third Amended R&O's to Nathan's Second Set |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 217 | Third-party clients or prospective clients | Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' first proposed redaction on p. 29 Exhibit 217 - Lively's Third Amended R&O's to TAG's Second Set of |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 203 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 203 - 10/9/24 J. Wallace Dep. Tr |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 208 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 208 - 10/21/2024 Email STREET 3.000304 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 209 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 209 - 10/21/2024 Texts STREET 3.000492 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 210 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 210 - 11/19/2024 Email STREET 3.000199 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 211 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Unseal Exhibit 211 - 10/28/2024 Texts STREET 3.000499 |

| Exhibit Number | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------|---|---|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 212 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 212 - 11/19/2024 Email STREET 3.000204 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 213 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 213 - 11/19/2024 Email STREET 3.000366 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 214 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 214 - 11/11/2024 Texts STREET 3.000486 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 215 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions except for the first message at 8:57 AM and the words "actually dropped" and "Page six" in the message at 9:41 AM Exhibit 215 - 6/4/24 Texts STREET 3.000495 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 216 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 216 - 8/16/24 Scope of Work STREET 3.000326 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 217 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 217 - Scope of Work STREET 3.000360 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 235 | Sensitive financial account information | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 235 - 10/1/24 Invoice STREET 1.000087 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 236 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' second proposed redaction ending the message at 2:30 PM Exhibit 236 - 8/10/24 Email STREET 1.000054 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 247 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Unseal Exhibit 247 Jed Wallace Depo Transcript excerpts 10/10/25 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 299 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information | Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively Exhibit 299 - 10/21/24 Scope of Work |

| Exhibit Number | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|---|--|---|
| Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 63 | PII and sensitive financial account information | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Ex 63 - invoice, dated August 8, 2024, produced by the Wallace Parties Bates stamp STREET 1.000008</p> |
| Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 64 | PII and sensitive financial account information | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Ex 64 - email, dated September 16, 2024, produced by the Wallace Parties bearing the Bates stamp STREET 1.0000084</p> |
| Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 65 | PII and sensitive financial account information | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Ex 65 - invoice, dated October 1, 2024, produced by the Wallace Parties bearing the Bates stamp STREET 1.0000087</p> |
| Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 66 | PII and sensitive financial account information | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Ex 66 invoice, dated October 9, 2024, produced by the Wallace Parties bearing the Bates stamp STREET 1.0000089</p> |
| Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 68 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information | <p>Unseal</p> <p>Jed Wallace Depo Transcript Excerpts dated October 10, 2025</p> |

Table B: Case and Koslow's Proposed Redactions and the Court's Rulings³

| Exhibit Number | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------------|--|--|
| Def. MSJ Ex. 233 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information | Unseal Exhibit 233 - KCASE-000001093, Aug. 9, 2024 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 236 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 236 - BBKOSLOW-000003330, Aug. 8-9, 2024 Text Msgs |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 192 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 192 - 7/26/2024 Texts KCase-000005073 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 194 | Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 194 - 7/29/2024 Texts KCASE-000000570 |

Table C: The Parties' Proposed Redactions and the Court's Rulings

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 18 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 18 - 6/19/23 Texts 24-CV-10049_0003488 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 19 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 19 - 6/22/23 Texts 24-CV-10049 0003611 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 22 (Def. MSJ Ex. 42) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 22 - 2/16/23 Texts BL-000008819, Exhibit 42 - BL-000008819, Feb. 16-17, 2023 Text messages |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 33 | Lively | Non-disclosed financial information | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 33 - 10/6/25 J. Stone Dep. Tr. |

³ Certain of Case and Koslow's proposed redactions overlap with those made by the Wayfarer Parties and are therefore addressed below in Table C.

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------|-------------------|-------------------------------------|---|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 81 | Lively | Non-disclosed financial information | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 81 - Invoice BL -000039376 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 82 | Lively | Non-disclosed financial information | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 82 - Invoice - BL -000039339 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 83 | Lively | Non-disclosed financial information | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 83 - Invoice BL -000039357 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 84 | Lively | Non-disclosed financial information | Unseal Exhibit 84 - 9/24/24 Invoice BL -000039395 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 85 | Lively | Non-disclosed financial information | Unseal Exhibit 85 - 10/4/24 Invoice BL -000039396 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 95 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 95 - 5/23/23 Texts BL -00021653 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 104 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 104 - 4/11/23 Texts BL-000009292 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 106 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 106 - 3/13/23 Texts BL-000008964 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 108 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 108 - 1/13/23 Texts BL-000008209 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 112 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 112 - 4/3/23 Texts BL-000009215 |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------|-------------------|---|--|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 114 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 114 - 1/24/23 Texts BL-00008353 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 135 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests (compensation data) | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 135 - 3/14/2023 Email 24-CV-10049_0002634 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 137 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 137 - 7/7/2024 Texts BL -000020972 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 152 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 152 - 5/19/2024 Texts BL-00039197 |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 39 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 39 - BL-000018396, June 25, 2024 Email |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 45 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 45 - BL-000018765 , Apr. 12, 2023 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 47 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 208 - LS_0000219, Aug. 13, 2024 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 48 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 48 - BL-000009349, Apr. 14-15, 2023 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 53 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 53 - BL-000009220, Apr. 4-5, 2023 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 87 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 87 - Sept. 12, 2025 Vivian Baker Depo. Tr. Excerpts |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|---|-------------------|-------------------------------|--|
| Def MSJ Ex. 95 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 95 - BL-000020770, May 28-29, 2023 Text messages |
| Def MSJ Ex. 102 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 102 - BL-000021967, Aug. 29-30, 2023 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 108 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 108 - BL-000009166, Mar. 29, 2023 Text messages |
| Def MSJ Ex. 133 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 133 - BL-000018808, Apr. 23, 2024 Text message |
| Def MSJ Ex. 134 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. A) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal except that the name indicated by the parties can be replaced as the Wayfarer Parties suggest Exhibit 134 - BL-000027070, May 17, 2024 Text messages |
| Def MSJ Ex. 135 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 135 - BL-000027069, May 17, 2024 Email |
| Def MSJ Ex. 136 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 136 - BL-000018824, May 19, 2024 Text messages |
| Def MSJ Ex. 137 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 137 - BL-000018810, Apr. 26, 2024 Text messages |
| Def MSJ Ex. 146 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 146 - BL-000028962, July 7, 2024 Email |
| Def MSJ Ex. 148 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 148 - BL-000031999, June 19, 2024 Text messages |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|--|-------------------|-------------------------------|---|
| Def. MSJ Ex. 149 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. B) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 149 - RR-SUBPOENA-000000082, July 13, 2024 Text messages Exhibit B RR-SUBPOENA000000082- RR-SUBPOENA 000000084 |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 205 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. F) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 205 - RR-SUBPOENA-000000116, Aug. 9, 2024 Text messages EX F - RR-SUBPOENA000000116- RR-SUBPOENA 000000119 |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 206 (R. 11 EX. H) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 206 - RR-SUBPOENA-000000102 , Aug. 10, 2024 Text messages Ex H - RR-SUBPOENA000000102- RR-SUBPOENA 000000105 |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 207 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. C) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 207 - RR-SUBPOENA-000000113, Aug. 12-13, 2024 Text messages Ex C - RR-SUBPOENA000000113- RR-SUBPOENA-000000115 |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 210 | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 210 - RR-SUBPOENA-000000025, Aug. 15, 2024 Text messages |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 211 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. I) | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Exhibit 211 - RR-SUBPOENA-000000120, Aug. 17-18, 2024 Text messages Ex I - RR-SUBPOENA000000120- RR-SUBPOENA-000000124 |
| R. 11 Supp. Opp. Ex. D | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal Ex - D RR-SUBPOENA 000000128- RR-SUBPOENA-000000129 |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|------------------------|-------------------|--|--|
| R. 11 Supp. Opp. Ex. E | Lively | Third-party privacy interests | Unseal RR-SUBPOENA000000030- RR-SUBPOENA-000000031 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 3 | Wayfarer Parties | Reference to non-party complaint | Unseal Exhibit 3 - 10/8/25 J. Heath Dep. Tr. |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 4 | Wayfarer Parties | Reference to non-party complaint | Unseal Exhibit 4 - 10/7/25 J. Baldoni Dep. Tr. |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 47 | Wayfarer Parties | Medical information | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 47 - 8/2/24 Texts NATHAN-000005552 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 58 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Unseal except for the proposed redactions on pp. 24 and 30 Exhibit 58 - Texts re. Articles Vituscka 000001 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 59 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; irrelevant and inflammatory non-party commentary | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 59 - 8/13/24 Texts KCASE-000002821 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 60 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-party and Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 60 - 8/13/24 Texts BBKOSLOW-000001024 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 61 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 61 - 8/20/24 Texts KCASE-000004756 |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------|-------------------|--|---|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 64 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to both the Wayfarer Parties' and Case and Koslow's proposed redactions Exhibit 64 - 8/13/24 Texts KCASE-000003354 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 67 | Wayfarer Parties | PII (phone number) | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 67 - 8/9/24 Texts HEATH-000048496 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 81 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-public financial information; film revenue receipts | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 81 - Invoice |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 82 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-public financial information; film revenue receipts | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 82 - Invoice |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 83 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-public financial information; film revenue receipts | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 83 - Invoice |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 90 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-public information about other Wayfarer projects | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 90 - 9/8/25 T. Hanks Dep. Tr. |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 188 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 188 - 7/24/2024 Texts JONESWORKS_00012591 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 190 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 190 - 7/26/2024 Texts JONESWORKS_00039746 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 191 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-party information and allegations | Unseal Exhibit 191 - 9/16/25 S. Jones Dep. Tr. |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------|-------------------|--|---|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 208 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 208 - 10/21/2024 Email STREET 3.000304</p> |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 209 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 209 - 10/21/2024 Texts STREET 3.000492</p> |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 212 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 212 - 11/19/2024 Email STREET 3.000366</p> |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 215 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions except for the first message at 8:57 AM and the words "actually dropped" and "Page six" in the message at 9:41 AM |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 216 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Exhibit 215 - 6/4/24 Texts STREET 3.000495</p> <p>Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively</p> <p>Exhibit 216 - 8/16/24 Scope of Work STREET 3.000326</p> |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 217 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively</p> <p>Exhibit 217 - Scope of Work STREET 3.000360</p> |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 221 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 221 - 8/9/24 Texts JONESWORKS 00016275</p> |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 222 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 222 - 8/13/24 Texts JONESWORKS _00014814</p> |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|--|--|
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 223 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 223 - 8/9/24 Texts NATHAN 000002124 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 224 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions at Dkt. No. 1159-3 Exhibit 224 - 8/8/24 Texts KCASE-000000728 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 246 | Wayfarer Parties | Competitively sensitive retainer agreement | Seal only the PII on the first page, the dollar amounts of the fees in Section 5, the dollar amounts in Section 8, the bank information, and the percentage in Section 8 Exhibit 246 - 12/24/24 Letter ABEL_000021588 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 247 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; non-public financial information | Unseal Exhibit 247 - 10/10/25 Wallace Dep. Tr. |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 280 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-public financial information | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 280 - 10/24/24 Email JONESWORKS WAYFARER 000003754 |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 292 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-public financial information | Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions Exhibit 292 - SAG AFTRA Contact |
| Pl. MSJ Ex. 299 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions Exhibit 299 - 10/21/24 Scope of Work STREET 3.000305 |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 167 | Wayfarer Parties | Competitively sensitive, irrelevant agreement terms | Seal only Section 2 Exhibit 167 - JONESWORKS WAYFARER_000003009, Aug. 2, 2024 Letter of Agreement be |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|------------------|-------------------|---|--|
| Def. MSJ Ex. 170 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 170 - KCASE-000002654, Aug. 4, 2024 Text messages</p> |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 188 | Wayfarer Parties | Non-party contact information | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 188 - JONESWORKS_00015018, Aug. 11, 2024 Text messages</p> |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 213 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions</p> <p>Exhibit 213 - JONESWORKS_00016275, Aug. 9, 2024 Text messages</p> |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 226 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal pursuant to the redactions provided by both the Wayfarer Parties and Case and Koslow</p> <p>Exhibit 226 - KCASE-000003856, Aug. 6, 2024 Text messages</p> |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 231 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; medical information | <p>Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions at Dkt. No. 1159-3</p> <p>Exhibit 231 - KCASE-000000728, Aug. 8-9, 2024 Text messages</p> |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 235 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | <p>Seal only the proposed redactions on KCASE-000003358, KCASE-000003359, the first redaction on KCASE-000003360, the first redaction on KCASE-000003361, and the remaining redactions proposed by the Wayfarer Parties</p> <p>Exhibit 235 - KCASE-000003354, Aug. 13-14, 2024 Text messages</p> |
| Def. MSJ Ex. 259 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; irrelevant personal information | <p>Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by both the Wayfarer Parties' and Case and Koslow</p> <p>Exhibit 259 - BBKOSLOW-000005795, Dec. 20-21, 2024 Text messages</p> |

| Exhibit Number | Sealing Proponent | Proposed Basis for Sealing | Court's Ruling |
|--|-------------------|---|--|
| WF Parties' Opp. to Lively Motion for Spoliation Sanctions Ex. 44 | Wayfarer Parties | Irrelevant and sensitive information relating to relationship between attorneys and clients | Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by the Wayfarer Parties Exhibit 44 – JA Discovery Item Retaining BF |
| Hudson Decl. In Support of Lively's Reply to Opp. to Motion for Spoliation Sanctions, Ex. 67 | Wayfarer Parties | Irrelevant and sensitive information relating to relationship between attorneys and clients | Seal only the PII on the first page, the dollar amounts of the fees in Section 5, the dollar amounts in Section 8, the bank information, and the percentage in Section 8 Ex 67 - letter, dated December 24, 2024, produced by Defendant Abel bearing the Bates stamp ABEL_000021588 |
| Hudson Decl. In Support of Lively's Reply to Opp. to Motion for Spoliation Sanctions, Ex. 68 | Wayfarer Parties | Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto | Unseal Ex 68 - Jed Wallace Depo Transcript Excerpts 10/10/25 |

SO ORDERED.

Dated: January 16, 2026
New York, New York



LEWIS J. LIMAN
United States District Judge